HALL COUNTY PLANNING COMMISSION RECOMMENDATION REPORT

Applicant	The Revive Land Group, LLC
Request	Rezone from Agricultural Residential III (AR-III, <u>17.110)</u> to Planned Residential Development (PRD, <u>17.180.060</u>)
Proposed Use	115-lot single-family development
Size	59.31± acres
Zoning	 Current Agricultural Residential III (AR-III <u>17.110</u>) Proposed Planned Residential Development (PRD, <u>17.180.060</u>)
Location	3302 & 3212 Antioch Campground Road and 3446, 3450 & 3456 Looper Lake Road Tax Parcels 10096 000006, 000004, 000059, 000061 and 000062
Commission District	Two
Planning Commission Date	April 1, 2024
Staff Recommendation	Denial, as the proposed use is inconsistent with surrounding zoning districts and the <u>Comprehensive Plan.</u>
Record Number	HZON24-0003
Planning Commission Recommendation Vote: 5-0	Approval, with conditions

Planning Commission Conditions:

- 1. The property shall be developed in accordance with the site plan dated March 29, 2024, and as described in the project narratives provided by the applicant, modified as necessary for compliance with conditions herein and development standards enforced at the time of site plan approval.
- 2. No variances or development exceptions are granted as part of this request unless explicitly listed herein.
- 3. The development shall be limited to 114 single-family homes.
- 4. The minimum heated floor area (HFA) shall be 1,800 square feet.

- 5. Building elevations shall be composed of a mixture of cement siding, stone, and/or brick façade, with a minimum of brick or stone accents on the front of the homes. The balance of the home may be the same material or of fiber-cement material. Vinyl siding is prohibited. Homes shall be consistent with the submitted renderings. Final review and approval of building elevations is subject to the Assistant Director of Planning and Development, or their designee.
- 6. Front-entry garage orientation may be semi-flush with the front façade, protruding no greater than 8 feet beyond the front façade as shown on the submitted plan elevations included in the project narrative. Garage door width shall not exceed 46% of the width of the front façade of the residence. No part of the residential structure shall be closer than 25 feet to the front property line.
- 7. The development shall be served by public sewer, with the obtainment of all required easements and other construction costs such as a lift station and force main to be the responsibility of the developer.
- 8. All lots shall access internal subdivision roads only. No lot shall have direct access to Antioch Campground Road, Looper Lake Road, or Allison Road.
- 9. All existing structures must be removed from the property prior to any residential building permits being issued.
- 10. The development shall be limited to a maximum of ten model homes prior to recording of the final plat. All life-safety regulations shall be satisfied prior to the issuance of a permit for a model home.
- 11. All designated open space, buffer areas, and stormwater detention ponds within the development shall be commonly held, and not by any individual homeowner(s).
- 12. All conditions of zoning shall be made a part of any plats or construction plans created for the subdivision.
- 13. According to 17.180.060.B.6.a There shall be two trees per lot. Trees shall be considered understory species, and may or may not be flowering trees, and shall not exceed a maximum mature height of 30 feet. Trees species are to be approved by the Assistant Director of Planning and Development, or their designee.
- 14. HOA, or property owner if located on a private individual lot, will be responsible for any portion of the sewer system not dedicated to the City of Gainesville and any sewer maintenance necessary for sewer lines not located within the public right-of-way or easements.
- 15. All chain link fencing around detention pond areas shall be black vinyl-coated. This standard shall not be applicable to the detention pond closest to Antioch Campground Road, which shall be designed as a shallow grassed and/or landscaped pond to maximize aesthetic appeal as shown in Exhibit A.
- 16. The lots impacted by the stormwater pond referenced in Exhibit A may be reduced in area to a minimum of 6,000 square feet. No more than 15 lots affected by this stormwater pond shall be permitted to be less than 8,000 square feet.
- 17. Development shall be age restricted, following HUD guidelines for 55+ communities.
- 18. A 10-foot landscape strip with an ornamental iron fence with brick or stone columns shall be installed along Antioch Campground Road. The applicant or developer shall have the option to install a fence and column of the same design along all portions of Allison Road, with prior notification of the Assistant Director of Planning and Development, and her acknowledgment.

- 19. Amenities including nature trail, pickleball courts, dog park, fire pit, and clubhouse shall be completed prior to twenty-five percent (25%) build-out. The developer shall have the option to construct a swimming pool instead of the pickleball courts. Additional amenities may be constructed by the developer at the discretion and approval of the Assistant Director of Planning and Development.
- 20. All retaining wall finishes shall be tumbled face products in natural stone colors.
- 21. Homes shall feature decorative carriage-style garage doors. A minimum of five (5) lots shall have homes with side-entry garages.
- 22. The pump station and discharge line shall be designed and constructed in such a way to accommodate only the subject development. The pump station shall not be upgraded or expanded to accommodate any future development.
- 23. Sidewalks shall be 5 feet wide on both sides of the road.
- 24. All traffic engineering standards shall be met, and associated costs shall be the sole responsibility of the developer.
- 25. The following statement regarding the potential impacts of agricultural operations in the area shall be made a part of any plat recorded on the property: "Owners, occupants, and users of property shown on this plat are hereby informed of the impacts associated with normal farming practices which may take place on adjacent and nearby property including, but not limited to, noise, odors, dust, the operation of machinery of any kind, the storage and disposal of manure, and the application of fertilizers, herbicides, and pesticides. Therefore, owners, occupants, and users of the property shown on this plat should be prepared to expect the effects of such practices."
- 26. Short Term Rentals shall be prohibited.

Excerpts from the minutes of the April 1, 2024 meeting

Applicant's Presentation:

Katie Greenway, Planning and Zoning Administrator, presented a summary of the request.

Neville Allison, 3500 Lenox Road, Atlanta, presented the request. The applicant stated that Hall County has a high demand for housing it needs to address. The applicant stated that they have changed their approach to the development and instead of building traditional family two-story homes, they are proposing a community for seniors. The applicant stated that they are willing to prohibit short term rentals since they can cause issues. The applicant reviewed proffered conditions and revisions to the site plan since the initial submittal.

Rebuttal

The applicant stated the development was being proposed as a 55 and over home community to reduce traffic impacts and the overflowing of schools. The applicant stated that sewer capacity has been granted by the City of Gainesville and it cannot be tapped in by any other developments so as to avoid setting a precedent for the area.

Public Forum:

Trey Campbell, 3659 Looper Lake Point, Gainesville, spoke in opposition. Concerns were density, narrow roads, traffic, and inconsistency with the area.

Deb Parrish, 3679 Looper Lake Point, Gainesville, spoke in opposition. Concerns were density, traffic, and inconsistency with the Comprehensive Plan.

Leonard Pace, 3687 Looper Lake Point, Gainesville, spoke in opposition. Concerns were inconsistency with the area, narrow roads, traffic, and property use.

Planning Commission Comments:

Mr. Braswell requested clarification of the site plan submitted March 29, 2024. The applicant stated that the updated site plan has a reduced number of units, one entrance off Antioch Campground Road and one off Allison Road, and has been changed to 55 and over residents only. Mr. Sosebee questioned if the applicant has reached out to neighboring residents. The applicant stated that they have not. Mr. Sosebee requested clarification on the request for a 10-foot landscape strip instead of a 4-foot berm along Antioch Campground Road. The applicant stated there is an existing natural berm there so a 10-foot landscape buffer will avoid having to grade and replant the area.

<u>Motion:</u> A motion to approve, with conditions was made by Mr. Hunt and seconded by Mr. Varner. Vote: 5-0

Staff Recommended Conditions:

- 1. The property shall be developed in accordance with the site plan dated February 29, 2024, and as described in the project narrative dated November 11, 2023 and supplemental narrative dated February 29, 2024, modified as necessary for compliance with conditions herein and development standards enforced at the time of site plan approval.
- 2. No variances or development exceptions are granted as part of this request unless explicitly listed herein.
- 3. The development shall be limited to 115 single-family homes.
- 4. The minimum heated floor area (HFA) shall be 2,000 square feet.
- 5. Building elevations shall be composed of a mixture of cement siding, stone, and/or brick façade, with a minimum of brick or stone accents on the front of the homes. The balance of the home may be the same material or of fiber-cement material. Vinyl siding is prohibited. Homes shall be consistent with the submitted renderings. Final review and approval of building elevations is subject to the Assistant Director of Planning and Development, or their designee
- 6. Front-entry garage orientation may be semi-flush with the front façade, protruding no greater than 5 feet beyond the front façade. Garage door width shall not exceed 46% of the width of the front façade of the residence.

- 7. All residential driveways shall measure no less than 22 feet from the back of sidewalk to the garage door.
- 8. The development shall be served by public sewer, with the obtainment of all required easements and other construction costs such as a lift station and force main to be the responsibility of the developer.
- 9. All lots shall access internal subdivision roads only. No lot shall have direct access to Antioch Campground Road, Looper Lake Road, or Allison Road.
- 10. All existing structures must be removed from the property prior to any residential building permits being issued.
- 11. The development shall be limited to a maximum of ten model homes prior to recording of the final plat. All life-safety regulations shall be satisfied prior to the issuance of a permit for a model home.
- 12. All designated open space within the development shall be commonly held, and not by any individual homeowner(s).
- 13. All conditions of zoning shall be made a part of any plats or construction plans created for the subdivision.

The following should be considered as exceptions to the Official Code of Hall County, and shall warrant further determination by the Board should it choose to approve the submitted narrative and site plan:

- 17.180.060.B.9.B Architectural Standards
 - Semi-flush. Garage doors shall be oriented towards the street. Garage doors shall be positioned between 5 and 20 feet behind the front wall plane of the residence, extending no more than 40 percent of the width of the residence.
 - The applicant proposes front oriented garage placements, with some renderings showing the garage doors positioned approximately 4 feet in front of the front wall plane of the residence; additionally, some renderings show the garage flush with the front plane of the residence. The applicant proposes a minimum 25' setback from right-of-way, which includes the 2' landscape strip and 5' sidewalk.
 - The applicant has proposed 16' garage doors which would be approximately 46% of the front façade.

• <u>17.180.060.6 – Landscape Trees</u>

- Landscape requirements. All requirements shall be met per chapter 17.280, tree protection. In addition, the following special items shall be addressed:
 - A minimum of two trees per lot shall be provided or preserved in the front, side, or rear yard. Trees shall not be counted if they are located in utility easements, drainage easements, or septic drain fields. The homebuilder shall be responsible for planting or preserving the individual lot trees prior to the issuance of a certificate of

occupancy. Trees that are provided or preserved to meet the two trees per lot may not be counted toward the overall development's tree density unit requirements.

- The applicant proposes to reduce the requirement to 1 tree per unit (115) plus any tree necessary to satisfy the development's tree density requirements.
- <u>17.430.100 Open Space</u>
 - The development shall conform to all open space requirements of sections <u>17.430.100</u> through <u>17.430.150</u>, as shown under the conservation subdivision design option chapter. The only open space requirement that may differ from those standards set forth in <u>section 17.430.110</u> is the open space shall comprise at least 30 percent of the gross tract area.
 - The applicant is requesting a variance from the requirements of sections <u>17.430.100</u> through <u>17.430.150</u>. The site plan shows a total of 47.8% open space. Although the open space is listed as 47.8% and meets the minimum standard, the open space would not be considered 75% contiguous.

Summary Analysis

The applicant is requesting to rezone a combined 59.31± acres of property zoned Agricultural Residential III (AR-III <u>17.110</u>) to Planned Residential Development (PRD, <u>17.180.060</u>) for the purpose of constructing a 115-lot, 55+ age targeted development with a gross density of 1.96± units per acre. The subject property is a combination of 5 parcels, with the largest of these parcels bisected on the lower southern portion by Allison Road. The portion north of Allison Road is currently vacant and forested. South of Allison Road, there is approximately 3.8 acres which have been designated as the location for the pump station and a portion of the overall open space. This southern portion is currently developed with structures that will need to be removed prior to any development of the subject property. The development as proposed includes a 50-foot planted buffer along the exterior boundaries of the site.

The applicant has provided elevations to illustrate the style of homes as well as a description of the building materials in the narrative for the proposed development. The renderings include elevation options for onestory homes and one and a half story homes. The project narrative states that the proposed residences range between 2,008 to 2,534 square feet. The proposed residences will feature a combination of masonry, Hardieplank materials, and shake siding. It should be noted that section <u>17.180.060(B)(9)</u> of the PRD code requires that all homes have at a minimum accents of brick or stone on the front of the homes. Additionally, section <u>17.180.060(B)(9)</u> of the PRD code requires front-loaded garage doors to be placed behind the front plane of the residence. The applicant has included a variance request for the front-loaded garage placement, with the garage doors to be positioned no closer than 25 feet from the right-of way, and measuring no more than 46 percent of the front façade of the residence.

The site plan includes three stormwater management areas, a pocket park, a clubhouse, a mail kiosk, two monument signs, and designates 47.8% percent of the development as open space. The open space consists of common areas, planted buffers and stormwater management areas. Per section <u>17.430.110(E)</u> of the code, 75% of open space must be contiguous. The applicant has requested a variance from this standard.

The project narrative states that the subdivision will have two main access points from Antioch Campground Road. The eastern entrance will be a restricted access (right in – right out) and the other will be a full-access entrance. The development has proposed public internal streets with five-foot sidewalks constructed along both sides. The narrative includes a request for two entrance monument signs. The proposed sign will be constructed with masonry walls, wood or PVC fencing, a gate house, operable or faux gates, ornamental sculpture, and illuminated signage in accordance with the Hall County Sign Ordinance. The application does not include any renderings of the proposed sign. Per county sign regulations, residential sign area is determined by the number of lots within a development. Based on the application materials, the sign face will be limited to 32 square feet in area.

Amenities for the community will include, at minimum, walking trails, dog park, and a pocket park. The narrative also states that the developer may choose to provide a playground, passive pocket parks, fire pit, and a pool and cabana with guest parking. Furthermore, the site plan features a clubhouse, mail kiosk, and pickle ball courts. No commercial uses are proposed within the development. The cluster mailbox unit area will feature twenty parking spots, as shown in the site plan. This exceeds the minimum parking spaces for a 115-lot subdivision as per <u>17.180.060(B)(11</u>).

Standard	PRD Requirement (<u>17.180.060</u>)	Proposed Development
Site Area	5 acre minimum	59.31± acres
Number of Units	-	115 detached single-family residences
Density	2 units per acre maximum	1.95 units per acre
Min. Lot Area	8,000 sq. ft.	8,000 sq. ft.
Max. Building	_	35 feet
Height		
Min. Open Space	30%	47.8%
Exterior Buffer	50 feet	50-foot planted buffer along perimeter
Front Setback	25 feet	25 feet
(Internal)		
Side Setback	5 feet	5 feet
(Internal)		
Rear Setback	20 feet	20 feet
(Internal)		
Parking	2 spaces for each dwelling unit	2-car garage per dwelling
	(<u>17.250.020</u>)	
Min. Heated Floor	_	2,008 square feet
Space		2,000 square rect
Garage – % of front façade	55% when recessed a minimum of 20	46% (2 styles: flush with front wall plane of
	feet behind front wall plan of	residence and protruding beyond front wall
	residence	plane) *

The proposed development standards for the project are described in the table below and are compared with the PRD requirements, (17.180.060):

Minimum Sidewalk Width	5 feet	5 feet
Cluster Mailbox Unit (CBU)	CBU with 13 short-term parking spaces	CBU with 20 short-term parking spaces
Note: Items marked with an asterisk (*) do not conform to <u>17.180.060</u> .		

Per the submitted narrative, the property will be served by Hall County sanitary sewer, and the developer will connect to utilities in the area via an onsite pump-station, with an existing force main located at the intersection of Looper Lake Road and Allison Road.

Several variances have been identified as part of this request. Any deficiencies identified as part of the plan will be required to comply with the requirements of the PRD unless specially granted by the board in the conditions of approval.

Based on the future land-use plan, staff finds the requested zoning designation is <u>not consistent</u> with the Hall County Comprehensive Plan future land use designation of "Lake Area Residential". This land use category is characterized by low-density residential development and neighborhoods. The intention of this land use category is to preserve established neighborhoods and create new permanent and vacation residential development. Future development will continue to be detached, single-family homes at low densities. The Lake Area Residential designation envisions a maximum density of 1 dwelling unit per acre, lower than the maximum density requirement within a Planned Residential Development (PRD, <u>17.180.060</u>) of 2 dwelling units per acre. The development has proposed a density of 1.95 units per acre.

Zoning Analysis

When considering a zoning amendment to the zoning maps, the following items must be considered:

- Whether the zoning proposal will permit a use that is suitable in view of the use and development of adjacent and nearby property; The zoning proposal may be suitable given the context of the surrounding area, though the proposed development is denser than the surrounding developments with an overall density of 1.95 du/acre. The surrounding area consists of vacant land and lowdensity residential and agricultural uses.
- 2. Whether the zoning proposal will adversely affect the existing use or usability of adjacent or nearby property; The proposed zoning classification of Planned Residential Development (PRD, <u>17.180.060</u>) will permit more intense uses than that of most adjacent or nearby parcels. This development will introduce more vehicular traffic onto Antioch Campground Road, which is a rural local road with a narrow pavement width.
- **3.** Whether the property to be affected by the zoning proposal has reasonable economic use as currently zoned. **The property appears to have reasonable economic use as currently zoned.**
- 4. Whether the zoning proposal will result in a use which will or could cause an excessive or burdensome use of existing streets, transportation facilities, or utilities; Per the submitted traffic study, turn lanes are not warranted at either driveway due to the low traffic volume along Antioch Campground Road. Both driveways also meet Hall County's sight distance requirements.
- 5. Whether the zoning proposal is in conformity with the policy and intent of the land use plan; The proposed use is not consistent with the <u>Comprehensive Plan</u> and the "Lake Area Residential" land

use designation. The recommended density for this character area is one dwelling unit per acre. The proposed development is proposing a density of 1.95 dwelling units per acre.

- 6. The extent to which property values are diminished by the existing zoning restrictions; Staff is unable to determine the extent to which property values are diminished by the existing zoning restrictions.
- 7. The extent to which the destruction of the subject property's value under the existing zoning promotes the health, safety, morals or general welfare of the public; Staff is unable to comment on the impact of property values without a full market analysis. Multiple factors impact property value including construction types, proposed uses, and maintenance. Often it is difficult to determine the effect of a development on adjacent properties until the development is completed.
- The relative gain to the public as compared to the hardship imposed upon the individual property owner;
 Staff has not identified a hardship imposed on the property owner as the property is currently zoned.
- 9. The length of time the property has been vacant as zoned considered in the context of land development in the area in the vicinity of the property; Tax parcels <u>10096 000004</u>, <u>000059</u>, <u>000061</u> and <u>000062</u> are currently undeveloped. The majority of tax parcel 10096 000006 is undeveloped, however currently there is are structures on the portion south of Allison Road.
- **10.** Whether there are other existing or changing conditions affecting the use or development of the property which give supporting grounds for either approval or disapproval of the zoning proposal; **Staff is not aware of any changing conditions that affect the use and development of the property.**
- 11. Whether the change would create an isolated district unrelated to the surrounding districts; The proposed zoning is a Planned Residential Development (PRD, <u>17.180.080</u>). Per the Official Code of Hall County, Planned Development Districts (<u>17.180</u>) are to be utilized as a "floating zone" which shall mean that areas will not be pre-designated as planned development districts but rather each such designation shall result from a specific and separate application for amendment. The proposed density is higher than that found on surrounding properties.
- **12.** Whether the present zoning district boundaries are illogically drawn in relation to existing conditions in the area; **There is no evidence that the present zoning district boundaries are illogically drawn.**
- 13. Whether the change requested is out of scale with the needs of the county as a whole or the immediate neighborhood; The proposed density is higher than that found on immediately surrounding properties but in general the use does not appear to be out of scale with the needs of the County as a whole, as there is a need for additional housing.
- 14. Whether it is impossible to find adequate sites for the proposed use in districts permitting such use and already appropriately zoned; There are other properties within the County that support a moderatedensity single-family residential uses based on the Future Land Use Map, though the development as proposed cannot be developed in any of the existing residential or multi-family districts without County Commission approval.
- **15.** Whether the need for rezoning could be handled instead by a variance request to the [Planning Commission]; **The request could not be handled alternatively as a variance.**
- **16.** Whether there would be an ecological or pollution impact resulting from major modifications to the land if the request is granted; **Any land disturbance activities on the property shall be required to go**

through the land development permitting process and as a result are subject to local, state, and federal regulations. As a result, there should not be an ecological or pollution impact resulting from any modification to the land if the request is granted.

17. Whether there is reasonable evidence based upon existing and anticipated land use that would indicate a mistake was made in the original zoning of the property; There is no indication that a mistake was made in the original zoning.

A Planned Residential Development (PRD, <u>17.180.080</u>) allows for more flexibility in the design and development of the property. This provides for a mixture of housing types and encourages maximum use of natural features through proper site planning measures. The development should conform to the existing character and development pattern of the surrounding area.

<u>17.380.050</u>. - Submission requirements for a rezoning request

- A. Any person or persons requesting a change in the official zoning map or use subject to approval of the county commission shall file an application with a plat or map of the property attached thereto, together with payment of such fees set forth in <u>chapter 17.30</u> to cover administrative and advertising costs, in the planning department office. Such person or persons or their authorized agent shall appear in person at the public hearing held to consider the district change. The proposal meets the requirement. The applicant has paid the appropriate fees and understands that someone must be present at both the Hall County Planning Commission meeting and the voting meeting of the Hall County Board of Commissioners.
- B. All applications for a change of zoning classification or use subject to approval of the county commission shall include:
 - A narrative statement identifying the existing and proposed use of the property and addressing each of the criteria set forth in section 17.380.060.C of this section [chapter].
 Proposal does provide a narrative outlining the intent of the development however, the applicant has not prepared a response to each of the criteria listed in <u>17.380.060.C</u>.
 - 2. A site plan drawn to scale designating the area covered by the application and identifying existing and proposed buildings and uses, adjacent existing land uses, zoning on contiguous parcels, including those across an abutting public right-of-way, and any other significant site improvements proposed to accommodate the proposed use or buffer adjacent uses, etc., or a plat of the subject property where no specific land use is proposed. In cases where only a plat or map is provided and no land use is proposed, the planning commission and county commission shall evaluate the application based on the most intense possible land use permitted in the proposed district. **Proposal meets this requirement.**
- C. For any application for a slow rate land treatment system (see <u>chapter 17.20</u>), the following additional requirements apply. **The proposed development will utilize public water and public sewer system.**
- D. For any application proposing the development of 100 or more residential dwelling units, a traffic impact study shall be submitted prior to consideration of the application by the planning commission. At the applicant's expense, the traffic impact study shall be prepared by a professional engineer in accordance with requirements established by the Hall County Engineering Department. The engineering department shall review the traffic impact study and forward any

comments to the Hall County Planning Commission. The proposal does meet the requirement. A traffic study has been conducted. No additional roadway improvements are recommended.

Development Support and Constraints

Hall County Environmental Health

In an email dated Friday, February 23, 2024, Emily McGahee stated "No comment. Public sewer."

Hall County Fire Marshal

In an email dated February 29, 2024, John Hornick, NPQ Fire Inspector 1, Plans Review Lieutenant stated the following:

"The Hall County Fire Marshal's Office considers the plan as proposed conceptual in nature and if approved may require modifications during the development review process."

Hall County Public Works and Utilities

In a memorandum from Public Works and Utilities dated February 29, 2024, Bill Nash, Director, stated the following:

Engineering:

This site may require a stormwater management report should the site plan indicate the proposed development meets stormwater thresholds for impervious surfaces and/or disturbed acreage. Show FEMA and Hall County studied Flood plains that are present on site. Show stream buffer and impervious setback from wrested vegetation not centerline of stream.

Traffic:

Roadways must meet Hall County subdivision regulations (code Chapter 16).

Utilities:

City of Gainesville sewer district

Georgia Department of Transportation

In an email dated February 22, 2024, Veronica Chavers, D1TO Civil Engineer 3, stated "GDOT coordination not required."